

Appendix 9.17 Traditional Neighborhood Alternative
Parking Study

Assessment of Parking Requirements

Silo Ridge Resort

Town of Amenia, New York

June 11, 2007

Client: Millbrook Ventures, LLC

Consultant: Thomas J. Calu

C O N T E N T S

- 1. Scope of Assignment**
- 2. Applicable Zoning Provisions**
- 3. Discussion**
- 4. Table of Proposed Minimum Parking Requirements**
- 5. Employee Parking**
- 6. Consultant's Qualifications**

1. Scope of Assignment

My services have been retained by Millbrook Ventures, LLC to provide an objective and realistic assessment of parking requirements for the Silo Ridge Resort development project in the town of Amenia, NY. Specifically, I have been asked to focus on minimum parking requirements. Deliverables were defined as including a narrative and table (“Proposed Minimum Parking Requirements”) for submission in a Draft Environmental Impact Statement to be prepared by others.

2. Applicable Zoning Provisions

I have been advised to apply zoning provisions as set forth in the Town of Amenia Public Review Draft of Revised Zoning Law dated January 19, 2007, including:

- ARTICLE IV OVERLAY DISTRICT REGULATIONS, 121-18 Resort Development Overlay District (RDO), and;
- ARTICLE VII SUPPLEMENTARY REGULATIONS, 121-38 Off-street Parking and Loading (see following paragraph).

In pertinent part, the RDO provides that “...the parking...requirements set forth in Section 131-38 shall not apply...” This provision recognizes the varying forms and circumstances of development, allowing for considerable discretion in determining the specific parking requirements for projects such as the Silo Ridge Resort.

Although not held applicable given the integrated, mixed-use proposal for Silo ridge, the following selection of parking requirements from those set forth in certain parts of Section 131-38 represents a reasonable starting point for discussion of parking requirements for certain aspects of the Silo Ridge Resort. Please note that these requirements are generally for stand-alone uses.

This information should not be relied upon without reference to the complete language set forth in the zoning document.

Minimum Parking Required for Residential Uses

Single-family or two-family dwelling units at 2 parking spaces per dwelling unit

Multi-family dwelling units at 1.5 parking spaces per dwelling unit

These requirements may be reduced for dwelling units below 1,000 square feet, senior citizen housing, mixed-use development or other appropriate circumstances.

Parking Requirements for Non-residential Uses

Retail or service business at 4 parking spaces per 1,000 s.f.

Industrial/warehouse uses at 2 parking spaces per 1,000 s.f. or 1 per employee

Office uses at 3 parking spaces per 1,000 s.f.

Lodging at 1 parking space per bedroom plus 1 parking space per employee and 1 parking space per 200 s.f. of meeting/function rooms

Restaurants, theaters, assembly at 1 parking space per every 3 seats

Parking requirements for uses not listed above are “as appropriate to the circumstances”

As written, the above are “provisional” standards, with respect to non-residential uses, subject to application or modification in consideration of factors including but not limited to acknowledging that 85% of anticipated peak demand may be satisfactory if there exists sufficient likelihood of arrivals by means other than single-occupant vehicles. In addition, as previously noted, the RDO recognizes the unique characteristics of integrated resorts and dispenses with these more conventional parking standards.

3. Discussion

In keeping with the letter and what I think can reasonably be considered as the spirit of the RDO, the physical characteristics of the Silo Ridge Resort site and the character of the development should be taken into account. This leads to recognition of some important factors that warrant attention in the determination of parking requirements for any and all proposed land uses.

Proximity to Commuter Rail Service (and Proposed Shuttle Service)

The entrance to the Silo Ridge Resort site is located just 1.4 miles from the Wassaic train station, which is served by MTA Metro North Railroad with trains connecting to the Southeast, NY station on the Harlem Line traveling on a regular basis to and from Grand Central Terminal in Manhattan on weekdays and weekends.

There is a growing trend toward permitting reduced ratios of parking for residential uses and certain other uses developed in proximity to mass transit.

This trend is most prevalent in urban areas and/or in high density developments within walking distance of frequent commuter service to major employment centers. In this case, the developer intends to provide a shuttle service for residents, guests and employees, for round-trip connections between the resort and the Wassaic train station as well as the Hamlet of Amenia. Details of the proposed shuttle service remain to be determined as the developer's plans evolve with the selected hotel operator.

Shared Parking; Parking Management Strategies; Overlapping Parking Allocations Arising out of Internal Relationships (between Land Uses)

The size of the development, its total parking requirements and the nature of mixed uses invite a number of opportunities for "shared parking." Shared parking strategies and (good) parking management practices should result in an overall parking requirement that is less than the total of the parking required for individual land uses under stand-alone circumstances.

A precise plan for shared parking is difficult to identify at this juncture, but certain examples stand out as having more potential than others. In addition, it is important to acknowledge a degree of overlapping among parking allocations arising out of internal relationships between land uses. In effect the resort is a planned "campus" on which many of those participating in any one land use are already accommodated in the parking allocation for one or more other land uses.

- An abundance of parking for the golf course and an abundance of parking for banquet facilities would, more often than not, result in an abundance of vacant banquet parking spaces in the morning and vacant golf course parking spaces in the evening.
- A considerable but as-yet undetermined percentage of golf course patrons will already be parked on campus, either in residential areas or at the hotel. The developer expects that this will account for a majority of golfers, as the golf course is expected to operate as a membership facility with semi-private services generally available only at off-peak periods.
- A considerable but as-yet undetermined percentage of spa patrons will already be parked on campus, either in residential areas or at the hotel. The developer contemplates a spa operation that will be nearly exclusive to resort residents and hotel guests.
- Other than for special events and private bookings, restaurant space and banquet facilities will be patronized by a majority of those already on campus, such as golf patrons and spa customers, who are already accounted for in terms of parking.

- Retail and office space land uses are merely incidental to the primary uses and do not rise to the level of warranting individual parking allocations.

In essence, the resort is a planned “campus” on which many of those participating in any one land use are already accommodated in the parking allocation for one or more other land uses.

Residential

A minimum allocation of 1.5 parking spaces per 2 bedroom flat is recommended, while an allocation of 2 spaces per unit is recommended for all 3 bedroom and single family or villa units.

Hotel/Other

The hotel category is comprised of 300 units at 1 parking space per unit, banquet/conference space at 1 space per every 3 seats and retail space requiring at least 24 parking spaces (which is 1/3 of the standard requirement for freestanding retail to recognize that most retail customers are already on-site).

Golf Course

As evidenced by an internet sampling of codes throughout the nation and information obtained from golf courses and golf management professionals, there is a great deal of discretion in determining the appropriate number of parking spaces for any given golf course.

The Professional Golf Association, which does have minimum standards for parking for driving ranges (1 space per tee), offers no standards for parking at 18-hole golf courses. There are a number of factors to consider, such as exclusivity, wait times, tee time policies and intervals, the pace of play and the availability of amenities. All information considered, I recommend a minimum allocation of 100 parking spaces to accommodate golf course requirements, especially given the campus considerations noted above. To the extent that organized golf outings might occur, the developer contemplates that such events would only be held mid-week when demand by members is predictably lower than on weekends. As such, and to the extent that additional golf parking could occasionally be required for such events, parking management strategies should be employed to accommodate the additional players, volunteers, guests and committee members associated with such events.

Spa

If applicable, zoning provisions for parking for the spa (retail and/or service functions) would require 4 parking spaces per 1,000 square feet of buildout, or as many as 392 parking spaces for 98,000 square feet, which is above and beyond what I would consider necessary for this development. This requirement is intended for a stand-alone facility and, accordingly, does not take into account the developer's reasonable expectation that parking for a significant percentage of spa customers will already be provided in parking allocations for other land uses, i.e., a good portion of spa customers will already be at the resort, many having arrived by means other than single-occupant vehicles. In addition, to the extent that the spa will accommodate off-campus customers, it is contemplated that most of such business will occur mid-week, which is off-peak for spa operations. Accounting for this, I have recommended a minimum spa parking allowance of 157 parking spaces.

4. Table of Proposed Minimum Parking Requirements

The following page is a Table of Proposed Minimum Recommended Parking Requirements that itemizes and quantifies proposed land uses by functional category according to the developer's current preferred building program.

Excluding employee parking, which is addressed below as a separate matter, I have recommended that the developer seek approval of an overall plan that provides for a minimum of 1,353 parking spaces, summarized as follows:

<u>Land Use</u>	<u>Parking</u>
Residential	642
Hotel	424
Golf	100
Spa	157
Winery Restaurant	27
Total	1,350

I also consider it appropriate to recommend that the developer be allowed flexibility in managing the overall parking allocation among and between various land uses in order to accommodate shared parking and shifts in demand throughout the operation of the campus during peak and off-peak periods.

5. Employee Parking

Noting that employee parking requirements are not included in the Table, I understand that the developer currently contemplates a total employee population of 228. It would be premature to make scheduling assumptions, but the developer has already planned for a dedicated allocation of 120 parking spaces exclusively for employees (except when otherwise utilized as part of an overall parking management strategy).

This relates to the developer's current assumption that a typical range of 40 to 60 percent of the employee population must be accommodated at any given time, noting that shared parking and other such factors come into play for employees no less than for other populations. In addition, since employee parking can be assigned among various sections of the campus, some relatively simple parking management strategies can be developed to accommodate any peak period requirements, e.g., assigned parking areas that will shift according to demand.

6. Consultant's Qualifications

In 2003, following 30+ years of public service, I opted for early retirement as Director of Economic Development & Parking for NJ TRANSIT. I have since established a successful consulting practice serving both public and private sector clients in matters of parking.

Having managed the planning, design, financing and delivery of a 3,540-space design/build, tax-exempt revenue bond-financed commuter parking deck at New Jersey's Metropark station, my work has involved decks and lots among more than 100 multi-modal locations, with over 25,000 spaces in revenue operation at over 40 locations.

I am recognized in New Jersey and more recently in New York to provide a full range of services in owner representation, initiation and oversight in feasibility studies and demand analysis, site planning, design, financing and project delivery strategies, revenue contract operations, access and revenue control systems, operational planning, security, customer service, pricing and policy. My work routinely involves team formation, plan development and review, scheduling, project staging and multi-task coordination with the planning, engineering, architectural, financial and legal disciplines, as well as in parking management and operations. Following are representative assignments, current as well as completed since 2003.

- Scoping and oversight of demand analysis and feasibility study, followed by management of project planning, design, financing, construction, parking management systems, security designs and operational planning for the Montclair Parking Authority's 430-space Crescent deck developed under public-private partnership with unique shared parking strategy to enhance adjacent redevelopment project. The project was presented as a model public-private partnership and demonstration of shared parking at New Jersey Future's 2007 Annual Redevelopment Forum.
- Parking strategist to the team of Townworks, LLC and the Regional Plan Association in the Eatontown Main Street Redevelopment Study.
- Consultant to Nexus Parking Systems in successful bid for a public-private partnership to develop a 2,200-space commuter parking deck at Hamilton train station; the project was completed in November 2006.
- Parking strategist to nationally ranked developers in preparing plans and proposals for mixed-use, transit-oriented redevelopment projects at the Hamilton, NJ (120 acres) and Netcong, NJ (13 acres) train stations.
- Advisor to Boiling Springs Savings Bank in design, operating plans and condominium budget submissions for a new 502-space deck supporting a mixed-use complex in Rutherford, NJ.
- Advisor to the Montclair Parking Authority from 2003 to present in matters of parking management such as policy, operations, access/revenue controls, on-street and off-street supply and demand management, rate strategies and stakeholder issues.
- Owner's representative to Hudson County Improvement Authority for a 1,450-space shared-use deck to be constructed as part of a redevelopment project supporting mixed uses and new stadium near PATH station in Harrison.
- Parking infrastructure development strategist to Hillier Architectural Group on redevelopment planning effort anticipating public-private partnerships and shared parking strategies for more than 4,000 structured spaces in 120 acre transit-oriented redevelopment at Princeton Junction train station.
- Infrastructure strategist to designated redeveloper for public-private partnership involving 1,500 structured parking spaces and a 20 acre mixed-use, transit-oriented development project at Aberdeen train station.
- Advisor to City of Asbury Park in policy and operational planning to advance plans for shared use of underutilized State-owned deck in order to provide residential and public parking as an anchor for redevelopment projects using payments-in-lieu-of-parking.

- Advisor to a private, NY-based developer in terms of demand and feasibility for a +/- 650-space commuter parking facility and ancillary mixed-uses proposed for development along MTA's Metro-North Harlem Line.
- Advisor to the Parking Authority of the City of Camden (NJ) in the evaluation and pursuit of two opportunities to acquire properties and develop new structured parking facilities through public-private partnerships.

In addition, I have managed competitive developer searches for a wide range of real estate offerings, and managed complex design/build contract efforts such as for a new 300,000 square foot tax-exempt financed office facility, nearly 400,000 square feet of office facility renovations and over 1,200,000 square feet of mixed-use condominium conversions in public-private ventures.

I have hands-on experience in forming public-private partnerships, especially in parking and transit-oriented development, and have served on the New Jersey Interagency Brownfields Redevelopment Team. Finally, I am experienced as liaison to the New Jersey Economic Development Authority in arranging tax-exempt financing for parking and other projects. I have carried signatory authority in bond indentures and certificate of participation financing, including having responsibility for the management of project accounts and trustee contracts, lockbox accounts, depository accounts and the scoping and management of coverage test certifications for projects valued in excess of \$100 million.

**Silo Ridge Resort
Tom Calu Parking Table**

June 6, 2007

Description	Proposed Minimum Requirements				RAMSA TNA Provided
	Quantity	Unit Description	Parking per Unit	Total	
Residential					
Flats (All 2 bedroom)	153	Units	1.50	230	230
Townhouse (All 3 bedroom)	146	Units	2.00	292	292
Single Family/Villa Units:	60	Units	2.00	120	120
Residential Total	359			642	642
Hotel					
Hotel	300	Units	1.00	300	300
Banquet/Conference	300	Seats	1 for every 3 seats	100	100
Retail on green	18,700	Square Feet	1.3 per 1,000 sf	24	24
Hotel Total				424	424
Golf Course/Clubhouse Total	1	Golf Club	100.00	100	108
Spa/Fitness/Wellness Total	98,000	Square Feet	1.6 spaces per 1,000 sf	157	157
Other					
Winery Restaurant	80	Seats	1 for every 3 seats	27	30
Maintenance Building					24
Other Total				27	54
Hotel/Golf/Spa/Other				708	743
Grand Total				1,350	1,385

Footnote:

The proposed parking supply shown above does not include any driveway parking or on street parallel parking.